

## Drive on Stalingrad SPI 11th Army Entry Analysis by Donald Johnson 09/27/2024

The 11th Army at Sevastopol was led by General Manstein and (in game terms) consisted of the German 22, 24, 50, 72, 132 and 170 Infantry Divisions and the German 28 Jaeger (Hunter/Light) Division along with the Romanian 18 Infantry Division and the Romanian 1 and 4 Mountain Divisions. It turns out that 3 Romanian divisions and 1 German division from the 11th Army at the Sevastopol battle do show up in the game. They are Rom 1 MtD on turn 7; Ger 50 ID & Rom 4 MtD on turn 8; and Rom 18 ID on turn 9. The other divisions in the 11th Army (Ger 5xID and 1xJD) went north in history. Manstein wanted them all committed to AGS, but Hitler sent 6 of them north; in game terms, a Hitler directive.

The 11th Army was tied up taking Sevastopol until July 4, 1942. Game Turn 1 is from June 28 to July 4 so it should not be possible for any 11th Army Divisions to arrive on turn 1; this is handled by the rule that there is no die roll on the Hitler Directive Table on turn 1. Manstein arrived near Leningrad on August 27, 1942 (turn 8) and the 6 divisions that moved north arrived at their destinations in AGN and AGC soon after. The Soviets launched Operation Uranus on Nov 19 (turn 21) encircling 6th Army on Nov 23 (turn 22) and Manstein returned to AGS on Nov 24 (turn 22) and launched Operation Winter Storm on Dec 12 (turn 24) and the game ends on turn 25.

A challenge for dealing with the 11th Army in the game is that the Hitler Directive table in the rules contradicts the HD table in the charts and the official errata does not address this. If you use the HD table on the charts, on Directive E or F you get 11th Army (with the 6 German divisions historically sent North) and this is theoretically possible throughout the game. If you use the HD table in the rules it is only possible in theory to get 11th Army on turns 3, 4, or 5 and only if you get Directive C or D. That is a dramatic difference.

Assume one uses the Hitler Directive Table as specified in the rules, it then depends on the victory points, game turn, and die roll bonus for those VPs, plus rolling an odd die roll to check whether to use the Hitler Directive Table this turn in the first place. The challenge in getting a C or D result is the die roll bonus (DRB), as that removes the possibility of getting the lower die roll results on the HD table. Consider turn 5 and the Germans with 40 VPs: the DRB is 5 and the turn 5 subtraction cancel out and a die roll of 1 results in C. This is a very slim chance indeed: 1/12 or about 8%. There is no way to get a D result on turns 3, 4 or 5 and no way to get a C result on turns 3 or 4 so one can ask why were these possibilities stated in the rules if they are not actually possible to achieve on the HD table?

It seems to me that the HD table in the rules is what is miswritten. The most obvious typo I can think of is that "C or D" in the HD table in the rules should be "E or F" as then the HD table makes more sense and agrees with the HD table in the charts. Of course, this resolution goes against the general idea that whatever is found in the rules trumps whatever is found in the charts, but that is my proposed resolution. After turn 9, with the last 11th Army unit that arrived in history for AGS one can assume Hitler has decided to sent the 6 divisions north unless they have already been committed on the game map to AGS.

Simpler variants are: (A) Hitler always sends the 6 divisions north as in history or

(B) Hitler always sends them south, arriving 2 at a time on turns 7, 8, and 9 (along with the others) when players wish to see what would have happened if this decision had been made.