

# ***SUGGESTED RULES CHANGES FOR BORODINO***

By Arthur Pigg

## *Moves Footnotes, Issue #11*

### **I. ARTILLERY–**

A. Has a three hex range. Its Combat Strength attenuates with increased range as follows:

1st hex – printed Strength + 1;

2nd hex –printed Strength;

3rd hex – ½ Strength (fractions rounded upwards. e.g.: A 7-3 unit becomes a 4-3 unit).

B. Can fire defensively–

1. – before other combat when being attacked by a cavalry or infantry unit. The artillery bombards with a doubled Strength. If the attacker survives, the artillery unit is eliminated (by survival is meant the infantry or cavalry does not suffer an "Ae" or "Ar." An exchange would be computed with the artillery as defender). If more than one Cavalry and/or infantry unit attacks, the defensive fire is concentrated against one hex only – the other unit(s) automatically eliminate the artillery. The defender has the option of defending only at normal odds in which case the battle is resolved without this rule.

2. – when artillery bombards artillery –

a. at the defender's option after resolution of all other combat in that phase,

b. units surviving on the hex they began that phase can return the fire (bombard) an artillery unit that attacked the defender's unit.

c. supporting a cavalry attack against infantry causes the odds column to shift up one column in favor of the attacker. For example, a 1 to 1 attack becomes a 2 to 1 attack. The Cavalry and artillery should each be at least one third of the infantry Strength.

II. CAVALRY, when attacking infantry–

A. –is attacking at half Strength when unsupported by any other class of unit.

B. –can co-operate with artillery according to rule 2-C.

### **REASONS FOR SUGGESTED RULES CHANGES FOR NAW AND BORODINO**

I. Artillery was often the decisive weapon to a degree not reflect in the current games.

A. While its effectiveness was considerably reduced, artillery smoothbores could. and did engage massed targets a kilometer away. Again, 400 meters was considered point blank range.

B. Artillery could literally blow away a force advancing against it with grape shot at close range. Also, black-powder cannon cannot conceal its position once it has fired. Counter battery work was a usual part of" a heavily engaged battery's job.

C. A battalion or brigade square against cavalry presented a perfect artillery target. Usually, only a few salvos were required to annihilate the hex.

II. Against disciplined, trained infantry under effective command (anything else is eliminated in these game mechanics) cavalry, by itself is impotent.

### **SUGGESTED RULES CHANGES FOR BORODINO**

I. French Infantry, when attacking, receive a bonus of one Combat Strength Point per unit of infantry involved in the attack.

II. Guard Units may be committed at will, but their loss is

effectively double. the loss of other units. They count twice in determining victory points. If the French "Old Guard" is eliminated, the French lose the benefit of rule #1.

III. Victory conditions for the Grand Battle game are based on the ratio of destroyed Strength Points as modified by rule # 2. The table is as follows:

<b>French Killed</b>	<b>Russian Killed</b>	<b>Victor</b>	<b>Level and Conditions</b>
2+	1	Russian	Decisive– if holding Borodino and 2 Redoubt hexes.
1-2	1	Russian	Substantial–if holding Great Redoubt.
1	1	Russian	Marginal–if holding Great Redoubt.
1	1	French	Marginal–if holding Borodino and 3 Redoubt hexes.
1	2	French	Substantial–if holding Borodino and all Redoubts
1	3+	French	Decisive–if holding Borodino and all Redoubts.

IV. French units exited off map on or between the two roads east force the removal of double their Combat Strength in Russian units. The Russian units are counted as lost.

V. Russian optional militia is used as 1-3 units unless Russian player is markedly inferior.

### **RATIONALES**

I. French infantry was still at its peak of offensive training. This bonus helps restore the superior

strength for attack the French actually possessed. In a historical situation where France had half again as many men, the game gives the French 172 CSP and the Russians 144 CSP in their field force, plus 15 CSP in redoubts, plus an optional 33 CSP in the militia (a force which historically would have been shattered by half its numbers in regulars). All this in a situation where the Russian is often safe in taking the offensive, makes a French victory unlikely in the game.

II. I think that the considerations leading to certain decisions should be given preference over forcing the player to accept someone else's decision.

III. See comments on rule # 1.

IV. The thought of Napoleon between them and holy Moscow would have driven most Russian units east as fast as possible – without orders – at the time of the battle.

V. Historical variants should be accurate possibilities or admitted attempts to achieve play balance. The strength given to the militia (much of which was still mustering) gives them better logistics, leadership, and training than seems possible.

*–Arthur Pigg*